Case 1:13-cv-06802-WHP Document 478 Filed 02/05/16 Page 1 of 2

PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON & GARRISON LLP 2001 K STREET, NW WASHINGTON, DC 20006-1047 TELEPHONE (202) 223-7300

WRITER'S DIRECT DIAL NUMBER

(202) 223-7356

WRITER'S DIRECT FACSIMILE

(202) 204-7356

WRITER'S DIRECT E-MAIL ADDRESS

kgallo@paulweiss.com

February 5, 2016

CORRECTED COPY

By ECF and Hand Delivery

The Honorable William H. Pauley III U.S. District Court, Southern District of New York Daniel Patrick Moynihan U.S. Courthouse 500 Pearl Street New York, NY 10007-1312

The Dial Corporation, et al. v. News Corporation, et al., No. 13-cv-06802 (WHP) (S.D.N.Y.)

Dear Judge Pauley:

We write on behalf of Defendants in the above-referenced matter to request permission to issue deposition subpoenas to the custodians of records of two non-parties, Valassis Communications, Inc. and Catalina Marketing Corporation.

As we discussed with Your Honor at the January 26, 2016 pretrial conference, over the past several months, five non-parties who produced documents in response to subpoenas have certified that their documents are authentic business records pursuant to Fed. R. Evidence 902(11). Unfortunately, two of NAM's competitors, Valassis and Catalina, have refused to certify certain of their own documents as authentic business records. We tried to resolve the matter through a stipulation with Plaintiffs but that effort also has been unsuccessful. Plaintiffs and Valassis have a common interest agreement in place related to this litigation. Accordingly, we reluctantly seek permission from the Court to issue deposition subpoenas to address these document issues.

The four narrow categories of documents for which NAM requires certification or testimony should not be the subject of any *bona fide* dispute:

• <u>SEC filings and transcripts of investor calls.</u> Valassis has refused to certify that its own SEC Form 10-K, and ten transcripts of investor calls, are authentic and that the statements were made as part of the ordinary

1285 AVENUE OF THE AMERICA NEW YORK, NY 10019-6064 TELEPHONE (212) 373-3000

UNIT 3601, OFFICE TOWER A BEIJING FORTUNE PLAZA NO. 7 DONGSANHUAN ZHONGLU CHAOYANG DISTRICT BEIJING 100020 PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA TELEPHONE (86-10) 5828-6300

12TH FLOOR, HONG KONG CLUB BUILDING 3A CHATER ROAD, CENTRAL HONG KONG TELEPHONE (852) 2846-0300

ALDER CASTLE 10 NOBLE STREET LONDON EC2V 7JU, U.K. TELEPHONE (44 20) 7367 1600

FUKOKU SEIMEI BUILDING 2-2 UCHISAIWAICHO 2-CHOME CHIYODA-KU, TOKYO 100-0011, JAPAN TELEPHONE (81-3) 3597-8101

TORONTO-DOMINION CENTRE 77 KING STREET WEST, SUITE 3100 PO. BOX 226 TORONTO, ONTARIO M5K 1J3 TELEPHONE (416) 504-0520

500 DELAWARE AVENUE, SUITE 200 POST OFFICE BOX 32 WILMINGTON, DE 19899-0032 TELEPHONE (302) 655-4410 The Honorable William H. Pauley III

2

course of Valassis's business. Seven of the transcripts were produced after the close of discovery by J.P. Morgan Securities LLC, an agent of Harland Clarke Holdings Corporation in its 2014 acquisition of Valassis. Versions of transcripts of all but one of the investor calls for which NAM seeks certification are available on the archives of Valassis's own investor website. Catalina likewise refuses to certify that six of its SEC filings are its own business records.

- <u>Valassis's own signed agreements</u>: Valassis has refused to certify that 50 signed contracts between Valassis and retailers or CPGs are authentic business records. Valassis itself produced all but three of the agreements, which were instead produced by Valassis's parent company, Harland Clarke.
- <u>Valassis's own data</u>. There are 84 data files, all produced by Valassis in response to our subpoena requesting data on their in-store sales and profitability projections. These documents come straight out of Valassis's own files and accounting system. Experts for both NAM and the Plaintiffs have relied on the data.
- Valassis marketing materials that it sent to retailers and CPGs. Valassis
 produced, and NAM seeks to certify, twelve documents that Valassis sent
 to retailers and CPGs promoting its in-store capabilities.

For these reasons, NAM respectfully requests permission to issue subpoenas to the custodians of records of Valassis and Catalina for depositions concerning the above-identified documents.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Kenneth A. Gallo Kenneth A. Gallo

cc: Counsel of Record (by ECF)